

Title Report on the CC's Bullying in Job Planning Survey

On the 10th May we launched our [survey on bullying in the electronic job planning process](#). We received 499 responses. The vast majority of respondents answered all questions.

57% of respondents were male and 42% were female, the ethnic groups with the highest representation were white British (45%), Asian or Asian British (15%) and Indian (12%) and any other white ethnicity (excluding Irish) (11%). The vast majority of respondents (84%) were aged between 40 and 60.

Our results show that overall, respondents had a negative experience of job planning. Below are some of the highlights of our results:

- Over 50% of respondents had a negative experience of their job planning meeting: 25% (122 respondents) thought that in their last job planning meeting they'd been bullied and 28% thought that inappropriate techniques had been used to get their agreement. Only 31% (152 respondents) reported that they'd been treated respectfully or that appropriate techniques had been used.
- 58% disagreed with the statement that job planning was used cooperatively at their last meeting, and only 24% agreed that it was.
- Only 15% agreed with the statement that at their last job planning meeting job planning was used well and was an effective tool. 65% disagreed or strongly disagreed.
- 80% of respondents' trusts used electronic job planning but only 7% of those who'd used it believed meetings had become less antagonistic since its introduction.

Direct Clinical Care PAs

- 57% of respondents' DCC PAs remained the same following their job planning meeting with approximately equal numbers increasing or decreasing their number. 41% of those whose DCC PAs were changed were very unhappy or felt forced to agree to changes, and 19% were not content.

SPAs

- Whilst most (62%) respondents' SPAs stayed the same, 33% of respondents' SPAs decreased. 74% of those whose SPAs changed were either not content, very unhappy or made to accept the change.

EDPAs

- Only 22% of consultants surveyed had EDPAs, and the majority of these retained the same number of EDPAs following their last job planning meeting. Of those whose EDPA's were changed, 60% were not content, unhappy or felt forced to accept the change.

APAs



- Of respondents with APAs, just over half stayed the same. For those whose APAs did change, 46% were unhappy, felt forced to accept the change or were not content.

Equalities data

The survey showed differing experiences for women and men, and for BAME and white people. It appears that ethnicity has a more profound impact than gender on doctors' experience of job planning. Overall, BAME women reported having the worst experience, followed by BAME men, then white women, then white men.

- BAME women had the worse experience of job planning. 39% of BAME women felt they were bullied at their last job planning meeting. 81% of BAME women disagreed that job planning was used effectively
- White women had a better, though still unacceptable experience. For comparison, 22% felt they were bullied at their last job planning meeting, lower than 27% of BAME men and 23% of white men. White women are more likely to think that job planning has not been used cooperatively, and not effectively than white men, but less likely to than BAME men, meaning that in general, white women have a better experience of job planning than BAME men.
- Of all groups whose data was analysed, BAME men had found meetings most antagonistic since electronic job planning was introduced, with 40% responding that they've found meetings much more antagonistic compared to 27% of white men, 23% of BAME women and 22% of white women.
- The lowest levels of finding job planning not being used cooperatively or effectively were reported by white men, however, they were more likely to have a negative experience than white women (46% vs 50% had a negative experience).

	BAME Women	BAME Men	White Women	White Men
Negative experience at their last job planning meeting	39% felt bullied 28% felt inappropriate techniques had been used	27% felt bullied 32% felt inappropriate techniques had been used	22% felt bullied 25% felt inappropriate techniques had been used	23% felt bullied 27% felt inappropriate techniques had been used
Since the introduction of electronic job planning job planning has been more antagonistic	23% found it much more antagonistic 27% found it slightly more antagonistic	40% found it much more antagonistic 14% found it slightly more antagonistic	21% found it much more antagonistic 14% found it slightly more antagonistic	27% found it much more antagonistic 13% found it slightly more antagonistic
Found that job planning was not used cooperatively	68%	64%	57%	51%
Found that job planning was used not effectively	81%	67%	67%	54%

Conclusion

For most of the consultants who responded, job planning meetings were a negative experience. Most respondents felt that they'd been bullied or subject to inappropriate techniques to gain their agreement to their new job plan. Most consultants were unhappy with the job plans that resulted from these meetings. Further, BAME consultants are much more likely to have a negative experience, with 39% of BAME women feeling that they'd been bullied at their last job planning meeting.